



Anton Marty & Karl Bühler

Between Mind and Language
Zwischen Denken und Sprache
Entre pensée et langage

Edited by **Laurent Cesalli and Janette Friedrich**

Dieses eBook ist seitenidentisch mit der gedruckten Ausgabe und verfügt u. a. über folgende Funktionen: Volltextsuche, klickbares Inhaltsverzeichnis sowie Verlinkungen zu Internetseiten. Die gedruckte Ausgabe erhalten Sie im Buchhandel sowie über unsere Website www.schwabeverlag.ch. Dort finden Sie auch unser gesamtes Programm und viele weitere Informationen.



SCHWABE PHILOSOPHICA

XVI

HERAUSGEGEBEN VON
HELMUT HOLZHEY UND WOLFGANG ROTHER

SCHWABE VERLAG BASEL

ANTON MARTY & KARL BÜHLER

BETWEEN MIND AND LANGUAGE
ZWISCHEN DENKEN UND SPRACHE
ENTRE PENSÉE ET LANGAGE

EDITED BY
LAURENT CESALLI AND JANETTE FRIEDRICH

SCHWABE VERLAG BASEL

Publiziert mit Unterstützung des Schweizerischen Nationalfonds
zur Förderung der wissenschaftlichen Forschung.

Copyright © 2014 Schwabe AG, Verlag, Basel, Schweiz

Dieses Werk ist urheberrechtlich geschützt. Das Werk einschliesslich seiner Teile darf ohne schriftliche Genehmigung des Verlages in keiner Form reproduziert oder elektronisch verarbeitet, vervielfältigt, zugänglich gemacht oder verbreitet werden.

Gesamtherstellung: Schwabe AG, MuttENZ/Basel, Schweiz

Printed in Switzerland

ISBN Printausgabe 978-3-7965-3214-6

ISBN E-Book (PDF) 978-3-7965-3332-7

rights@schwabe.ch
www.schwabeverlag.ch

Inhalt

<i>Laurent Cesalli, Janette Friedrich</i>	
Introduction	VII
Abstracts	XVII
Abbreviations	XXV

Erster Teil

Phenomenological, pragmatic, and semiotic approaches to language
Phänomenologische, pragmatische und semiotische Annäherungen an die Sprache
Approches phénoménologique, pragmatique et sémiotique du langage

Claudio Majolino

Par-delà la suppléance. Contributions à une sémiotique phénoménologique: Bühler et Marty	3
--	---

Frank Liedtke

Ausdrücken und Bedeuten: Anton Martys Sprachphilosophie im Lichte der Kritik Karl Böhlers	43
--	----

Laurent Cesalli

Marty, Bühler, and Landgrebe on Linguistic Functions	59
--	----

Zweiter Teil

Contributions to descriptive psychology
Beiträge zur deskriptiven Psychologie
Contributions à la psychologie descriptive

Guillaume Fréchette

Fixer, interpréter, déterminer. Éléments de psychologie descriptive de Brentano et Marty à Bühler	79
--	----

Denis Fisette

Phénomènes sensibles et fonctions psychiques:
Karl Bühler et le programme de Stumpf 103

Janette Friedrich

Disposition d'attention, schèmes et sphère de signification
Comment Bühler défend-il une psychologie de la pensée? 141

Dritter Teil

Semantic and ontological issues
Semantische und ontologische Fragen
Questions sémantiques et ontologiques

Robin D. Rollinger

Brentano and Marty on Logical Names and Linguistic Fictions:
A Parting of Ways in the Philosophy of Language 167

Arkadiusz Chrudzimski

Marty on Truth-Making 201

Vierter Teil

Empirical approaches to language
Empirische Dimensionen der Sprache
La dimension empirique du langage

Didier Samain

Wegener, Gardiner, Bühler
Une problématique ou deux modes d'empiricité? 237

Jacques Moeschler

Remarques sur la *Théorie du langage* du point de vue
de la pragmatique contemporaine 267

Clemens Knobloch

Was die Neo-Evolutionisten *in puncto* Signalevolution
von Bühler und Marty lernen könnten 293

Personenregister* 331

Introduction

LAURENT CESALLI, JANETTE FRIEDRICH

In 1908, Anton Marty (1847–1914) publishes his *opus maius*, the *Untersuchungen zur Grundlegung der allgemeinen Grammatik und Sprachphilosophie*, a work which is presented to Brentano at the occasion of his 70th birthday.¹ In this monumental work, Marty develops what he labels a «descriptive theory of meaning» (*deskriptive Bedeutungslehre*) which provides an explanation of linguistic meaning based on Brentano's descriptive psychology. In 1909, Karl Bühler (1879–1963) publishes a long review of Marty's book, in which he sets the foundations of what would become, some twenty-five years later, his own *Sprachtheorie. Die Darstellungsfunktion der Sprache*.² This

¹ On Marty's philosophy of language, see Robin Rollinger: *Philosophy of Language and Other Matters in the Works of Anton Marty* (Amsterdam 2010); Wilhelm Baumgartner (ed.): *The Philosophy of Anton Marty*, in: *Brentano Studien* 12 (2009); Denis Fisette, Guillaume Fréchette (eds.): *A l'école de Brentano. De Würzburg à Vienne* (Paris 2007); Paolo Spinicci: *Il significato e la forma linguistica. Pensiero, esperienza e linguaggio nella filosofia di Anton Marty* (Milano 1991); Kevin Mulligan (ed.): *Mind, Meaning and Metaphysics. The Philosophy and Theory of Language of Anton Marty* (Dordrecht 1990); Savina Raynaud: *Anton Marty, filosofo del linguaggio: uno strutturalismo presaussuriano* (Roma 1982).

² On Bühler's philosophy of language, see Robert Innis: *Karl Bühler. Semiotic Foundations of Language Theory* (New York, London 1982); Achim Eschbach (Hg.): *Bühler-Studien Bd. 1 & 2* (Frankfurt a.M. 1984); Achim Eschbach (ed.): *Karl Bühler's theory of language: proceedings of the conferences held at Kirchberg, August 26, 1984 and Essen, November 21–24, 1984* (Amsterdam, Philadelphia 1988); Sandrine Persyn-Vialard: *La linguistique de Karl Bühler. Examen critique de la Sprachtheorie et de sa filiation* (Rennes 2005); Janette Friedrich: *Présentation*, in: *Karl Bühler, Théorie du langage. La fonction représentationnelle du langage* (Marseille 2009) 21–58; Janette Friedrich (éd.): *Karl Bühler. Une pensée du langage*, *Verbum*, vol. XXXI, 1–2 (2009); Perrine Marthelot: *Karl Bühler. Du contexte à la situation, la signification* (Paris 2012); Karl Bühler: *Schriften zur Sprachtheorie*, hg. v. Achim Eschbach (Tübingen 2012). For a list of

original link of Marty's and Bühler's thoughts offers an obvious reason for devoting a volume to their philosophies of language.

As many of the contributions gathered in this book show, the discussion of Marty is far more than a mere occasion for Bühler to express his central insight in matters of language; as a matter of fact, Bühler's functional approach to language and more precisely the idea that the function of representation (*Darstellungsfunktion*) is the fundamental one directly emerges from a tight discussion of Marty's intentionalist semantics (i.e. the claim that meaning is to be explained primarily in terms of speakers' intentions):

From Marty's own point of view, one should therefore add, besides the functions of conscious manifestation (of expression) and of influencing others' psychic life (of meaning), a third function, that of representing [*Darstellen*].³

Furthermore, both authors converge in the idea that philosophy of language and psychology (or philosophy of mind, as we would call it nowadays) are undissociably linked. In this short introduction, we shall have a glance at the main lines of affinity and divergence existing between Marty and Bühler, but also at the origin and posterity of their theories of language. The papers gathered below take up different aspects of such a narrative and often widen the perspective by integrating other protagonists of the Austro-German tradition into the picture.

1. Psychology and philosophy of language

According to Marty's conception and division of philosophy, the *descriptive* theory of meaning (*deskriptive Bedeutungslehre* – i.e. the field of research to which he devoted most of his works) is one of the two branches of psychology of language (*Sprachpsychologie*), the other being of *genetic* nature. As its name tells it, the descriptive part is concerned with the general structure and

Bühler's linguistic works, see Brigitte Schlieben-Lange: Bühler, Karl [revised by Janette Friedrich], in: Harro Stammerjohann (ed.): *Lexicon grammaticorum: a bio-bibliographical companion to the history of linguistics*, vol. 1, 2nd edition, revised and enlarged (Tübingen 2009) 224.

³ AMU 965.

functioning of language as it exists and functions now, while the genetic one is interested in the historic and causal processes which lead from the origins of language to its actual form. Psychology of language, in turn, is the theoretical branch of philosophy of language (*Sprachphilosophie*), the other being practical philosophy of language (*Glossonomie*), itself divided into aesthetics, logic, ethic and praxis.⁴ As a consequence, semantics is to be considered as a part of psychology of language.

The predominant role of psychology also appears in Marty's conception of philosophy as «that domain of knowledge comprising psychology as well as all the disciplines which, according to the work division principle (*Prinzip der Arbeitsteilung*), are to be intimately linked with psychological research».⁵ The same holds for his definition of philosophy of language – «to the philosophy of language belong all those questions from the science of language which are directed upon that which, in the science of language, is general and governed by laws (*das Allgemeine und Gesetzmäßige*), questions which are of psychological nature or cannot be answered without the essential help of psychology»⁶ – and even for his definition of language itself – «[language] is the deliberate manifestation (*absichtliche Kundgabe*) of psychic life by means of sounds, in particular by means of sounds which are not understandable in themselves but only in virtue of convention and habit».⁷ As for linguistic meaning – Marty's object of investigation *par excellence* – its analysis is also based on psychology. Meaning is a matter of speakers' intentions primarily aimed at triggering psychic phenomena in hearers:

We said that language, within the science and philosophy of language, is primarily understood as the intentional indication (*absichtliche Kundgabe*) of the inner life. However, what is primarily intended in this indication is a corresponding influence of the foreign inner life. As a rule, one expresses one's own presentations, judgments, feelings etc., in order to bring about presentations, judgments and emotions in another psychic being, and indeed, ones which are analogous to one's own.⁸

⁴ On that division, see UGS 21–33.

⁵ Anton Marty: Was ist Philosophie?, in: Josef Eisenmeier, Alfred Kastil, Oskar Kraus (Hg.): Anton Marty. Gesammelte Schriften, Bd. I,1 (Halle a.S. 1916 [1896]) 69–93 (here 82–87).

⁶ PST 83.

⁷ PST 81.

⁸ UGS 22.

Consequently, at the core of the elucidation of linguistic meaning lies the question of what it means for a subject to think of an object – in short: the theory of meaning is closely related to the one of intentionality.

As for Bühler, he is primarily interested in questions regarding the psychology of thought (*Psychologie des Denkens*), questions which are dealt with in his *Habilitation* of 1907.⁹ The influence of Brentano's descriptive psychology is manifest in this work. In defining his task as consisting in the determination of the so called *constituents of thought* by means of the introspective method (or, more precisely, of the mnemonic observation, as Brentano would say),¹⁰ Bühler claims at the same time that such an analysis is to be viewed as the quest for psychic correlates of what Husserl describes as the functioning and contents of the laws of logic.¹¹ In following such an experimental approach and confirming the distinction between *psychic functions* and *formations* (*Gebilde*), already observed by Stumpf in his works of 1906,¹² Bühler delineates his field of investigations for the years to come. Bühler's aim is to elucidate and give a detailed analysis of the mutual dependence between psychic functioning and formations (as *language* or *gestalt*, for example). Such an aim also explains two programmatic remarks he makes at the turn of the thirties. The first describes his own position as the one of a believer sided by two prophets – psychology on one side, and philosophy on the other:

Prophet to the right, prophet to the left, and the child of this world in the middle. The theory of language must be the child of this world, that is, the simple tip of the empirical work of language researchers. If philosophy perceives the danger of *epis-*

⁹ Karl Bühler: *Tatsachen und Probleme zu einer Psychologie der Denkvorgänge: I. Über Gedanken*, in: *Archiv für die gesamte Psychologie* 10 (1907) 297–365; Karl Bühler: *Tatsachen und Probleme zu einer Psychologie der Denkvorgänge: II. Über Gedankenzusammenhänge*, in: *Archiv für die gesamte Psychologie* 12 (1908) 1–23; Karl Bühler: *Tatsachen und Probleme zu einer Psychologie der Denkvorgänge: III. Über Gedankenerinnerungen*, in: *Archiv für die gesamte Psychologie* 12 (1908) 24–92.

¹⁰ Karl Bühler: *Remarques sur les problèmes de la psychologie de la pensée*, in: *Archives de psychologie* 6 (1907) 376–377; PES chap. 2.

¹¹ Bühler: *Tatsachen und Probleme zu einer Psychologie der Denkvorgänge: I.*, 298–299.

¹² Carl Stumpf: *Zur Einteilung der Wissenschaften*, in: *Abhandlungen der Königlich-Preussischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, Philosophisch-historische Classe V* (Berlin 1906) 33–37 (here 9–10).

temologism, that is, a declaration extorted from language in favour of one of the fundamental epistemological attitudes, it is only right and proper for it to demand the same respect for its independence from the prophet to the left. Psychology is the prophet to the left.¹³

The second remark is to be found in *Die Krise der Psychologie* (1927) where Bühler states without ambiguity: «I did not come in order to reform psychology, but in order to discover the axioms of the theory of language. A book which is nearly achieved, *The Theory of Language*, will tell more about that.»¹⁴

This interest for language did not arise in 1927. In the foreword of the *Theory of Language*, he mentions the §16 of his *Habilitation* on the psychology of thought as a first reflexion on language. Two years later (1909), he writes his long review of Marty's *Untersuchungen* and announces that «further casual writings on that topic»¹⁵ will follow. One could wonder, then, if with the publication of the *Theory of Language*, Bühler definitively leaves the domain of psychology in order to be on the side of the sciences of language, to which he now intends to contribute. One could adopt such a reading, provided that one considers that the *Theory of Language* contains only the instrumental model of language (*Organonmodell*) discussing the three functions of appeal (*Appell*), expression (*Kundgabe*), and representation (*Darstellung*), as well as the semiotic nature of language.¹⁶ It is this first part of the *Theory of Language* which is most often referred to in language sciences when Bühler is mentioned. However, his *Theory of Language* contains also – *in the first place* – a description of the way linguistic phenomena function, a description given in terms of fields (*Felder*) and which necessarily involves the psychological subject, without which the representation by language is not possible. Thus, even if Bühler neither defends an intentionalist theory of meaning, nor pleads for a phenomenological description of language (see the contribution of Claudio Majolino in the present volume), psychology remains an essential piece of his conception, for he constantly seeks to determine *what it means for a subject to speak* (to use language).¹⁷ Bühler's *Theory of Language* is therefore

¹³ TL 65.

¹⁴ KP 29.

¹⁵ TL 69.

¹⁶ See the first part of ST entitled «The Principles of Language Research».

¹⁷ Cf. Janette Friedrich: Karl Bühler. Une pensée du langage, in: Janette Friedrich (ed.): Karl Bühler. Une pensée du langage, 3–26.

not to be viewed only as an extremely rich contribution to the sciences of language, but also as a sketch of Bühler's original conception of the domain studied by psychology, a conception according to which it is difficult to consider this domain and language separately.

Thus, the starting point, but also the challenge of this book have been to assess the indissoluble link between psychology and philosophy of language in the thought of Bühler and Marty. As the different contributions gathered in this book show, the dialogue between Marty and Bühler sheds a different light on both protagonists, either in balancing or sharpening the established readings of their works (and thereby considerably enriching this reading) or in suggesting readings diverging from the ones which are usually found in the reception of both thinkers. Bühler and Marty are discussed as representatives of the Austro-German tradition of philosophy of language, a perspective which enables to highlight certain elements of their doctrine which are too often ignored by reductive disciplinary approaches (either from linguistics or from psychology) and would otherwise probably remain unnoticed. In this respect, the analysis of linguistic expressions offered by Marty and Bühler lies beyond the traditional opposition between semantic, semiotic and pragmatic approaches. This is even true of contributions centred on one author only, but which appear to be orientated by the interdisciplinary exchange aimed at in this book.

2. *The reception of Marty and Bühler*

The present volume is the newest piece in the reception of Marty and Bühler. As far as the former is concerned, one can distinguish three phases in the hitherto rather modest reception of his thought. The first is so to speak immediate for it takes place either in Marty's lifetime, or immediately after his death. The most important contributions of this first phase are the review by Husserl of Marty's *Über subjektlose Sätze*, published in 1896,¹⁸ and the one by Bühler of Marty's *Untersuchungen zur Grundlegung der allgemeinen*

¹⁸ Edmund Husserl: Aufsätze und Rezensionen (1890–1910), hg. v. Bernhard Rang (Den Haag 1979) [Husserliana XXII] 135–136, 236–258.

Grammatik und Sprachphilosophie, published in 1909,¹⁹ as well as the monographs of Funke and Landgrebe.²⁰ The second phase of the reception of Marty's ideas takes place in the eighties and early nineties of the last century. Its main pieces are Raynaud's book presenting Marty as a pre-structuralist, the monograph of Spinicci appropriately relating Marty with Husserl, and above all, the volume edited by Mulligan gathering some thirteen studies covering Marty's philosophy of language and mind, but also his metaphysics.²¹ A third phase is presently taking place. Besides the volume at hand, one should mention the special issue of the *Brentano Studien* on Marty, as well as Rollinger's monograph²² associating an extensive historical and doctrinal introduction with the English translation of four texts: Marty's first book, *Über den Ursprung der Sprache*, his inaugural speech as Rector of the university of Prag (1896), *Was ist Philosophie?*, extensive reviews of James: *Anzeige zu William James' Werk: The Principle of Psychology* and of Meinong's first edition of *Über Annahmen*.

For what regards the reception of Bühler's ideas, one can recall that his institute of psychology in Vienna was, in the beginning of the thirties, one of the most prominent ones in Europe at the time. As a consequence, Bühler's writings, and his *Sprachtheorie* in particular, were discussed in numerous reviews and papers.²³ However, the scientific debate around Bühler's ideas stops

¹⁹ AMU.

²⁰ Otto Funke: *Innere Sprachform. Eine Einführung in Anton Martys Sprachphilosophie* (reprint: Hildesheim 1974 [Reichenberg 1924]); NW; Two monographs in Japanese must be mentioned here: Chikahira Kobayashi: *Maruti no gengogaku* (Tokyo 1937) [«On Marty's theory of language»]; Fumio Nakajima: *Imiron: bunpo no genri* (Tokyo 1939) [Semantics. An Introduction to Marty's Philosophy of Language].

²¹ S. Raynaud: Anton Marty, filosofo del linguaggio; P. Spinicci: Il significato e la forma linguistica; K. Mulligan: Mind, Meaning, and Metaphysics. One should also mention here the works of the linguist S. Y. Kuroda, who studied Marty from the perspective of Chomsky's transformational grammar («Anton Marty and the Transformational Theory of Grammar», *Foundation of Language*, 9 [1972] 1–37; «The Categorical and the Thetic Judgement», *Foundation of Language*, 9 [1972] 153–185).

²² W. Baumgartner: *The Philosophy of Anton Marty*; R. Rollinger: *Philosophy of Language and other Matters*.

²³ See for example Hellmuth Dempe: *Was ist Sprache? Eine sprachphilosophische Untersuchung im Anschluss an die Sprachtheorie Karl Bühlers* (Weimar 1930).